Demographic Inference

Ryan Gutenkunst Molecular and Cellular Biology University of Arizona

Data tuna

1.6.....

	ame	Data type	merence	Notes
S	STRUCTURE	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	User-friendly GUI; can be computationally demanding
FF	FRAPPE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Alexander et al. ⁴¹ argue that convergence is not guaranteed
A	ADMIXTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Estimates the number of populations via cross-validation error
fa	fastSTRUCTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Obtains variational Bayesian estimates of posterior probability distribution
St	Structurama	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	Uses a Dirichlet process to estimate the number of populations
н	HAPMIX	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Requires populations to be specified a priori
fir	fineSTRUCTURE	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Can be used to identify the number and identity of populations
G	GLOBETROTTER	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Extends the fineSTRUCTURE approach to estimate unsampled ancestral populations and admixture times
L	LAMP	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Identifies local ancestry in windows, rather than using an HMM, so is more discrete than other approaches
P	PCAdmix	Phased haplotypes	Chromosome painting, population structure	Uses PCA in small chunks followed by an HMM to estimate local ancestry $% \left({{{\rm{D}}_{\rm{A}}}} \right)$
de	dadi	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Requires some Python-coding skills; applicable to up to three populations
Fa	Fastsimcoal2	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Can also be used to simulate data under the SMC
Tr	Treemix	Frequencies of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Admixture graph	Highly multimodal likelihood surface and heuristic search; redo inference from many starting points
fa	fastNeutrino	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Applicable only to a single population; designed specifically for extremely large sample sizes
D	DoRIS	Lengths of IBD blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic history	IBD must be inferred (for example, using Beagle or GERMLINE); specification of lower cut-off minimizes false-negative IBD tracts
IB	IBS tract inference	Lengths of IBS blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic	IBS can easily be confounded by missing data and/or sequencing errors
P	PSMC	Diploid genotypes from one individual	Demographic history	Best used in MSMC's PSMC mode, which uses the SMC to more accurately model recombination than the original PSMC; applicable to a single population
М	MSMC	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires large amounts of RAM; cross-coalescence rate should not be interpreted as migration rate
C	CoalHMM	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Multiple applications, including inference of population sizes, migration rates and incomplete lineage sorting
di	diCal	Medium-length, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Uses shorter sequences than MSMC, but can be applied to multiple individuals in complex demographic models; infers explicit population genetic parameters for migration rates
	LAMARC	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires Monte Carlo sampling of coalescent genealogies; very flexible
В	BEAST	Short, phased haplotypes	Species trees, effective population sizes	Used mainly as a method of phylogenetic inference. Can also infer population size history
М	MCMCcoal	Short, phased haplotypes	Divergence times between populations	Now incorporated into the software BPP ¹³¹
G	G-PhoCS	Short, (un)phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Incorporates migration into the MCMCcoal framework. Averages over unphased haplotypes
E) u fu	Exact likelihoods using generating functions	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Implemented in Mathematica; applicable only to specific classes of multi-population models

 Essentially, all models are wrong, but some are useful.

— George Box



Name	Data type	Inference	Notes	Refs
STRUCTURE	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	User-friendly GUI; can be computationally demanding	32
FRAPPE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Alexander $et al.$ ⁴¹ argue that convergence is not guaranteed	40
ADMIXTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Estimates the number of populations via cross-validation error	41
fastSTRUCTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Obtains variational Bayesian estimates of posterior probability distribution	42
Structurama	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	Uses a Dirichlet process to estimate the number of populations	43
HAPMIX	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Requires populations to be specified a priori	48
fineSTRUCTURE	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Can be used to identify the number and identity of populations	49
GLOBETROTTER	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Extends the fineSTRUCTURE approach to estimate unsampled ancestral populations and admixture times	7
LAMP	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Identifies local ancestry in windows, rather than using an HMM, so is more discrete than other approaches	52
PCAdmix	Phased haplotypes	Chromosome painting, population structure	Uses PCA in small chunks followed by an HMM to estimate local ancestry	53
dadi	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Requires some Python-coding skills; applicable to up to three populations	60
Fastsimcoal2	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Can also be used to simulate data under the SMC	62,63
Treemix	Frequencies of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Admixture graph	Highly multimodal likelihood surface and heuristic search; redo inference from many starting points	64
fastNeutrino	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Applicable only to a single population; designed specifically for extremely large sample sizes	65
DoRIS	Lengths of IBD blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic history	IBD must be inferred (for example, using Beagle or GERMLINE); specification of lower cut-off minimizes false-negative IBD tracts	71,72
IBS tract inference	Lengths of IBS blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic	IBS can easily be confounded by missing data and/or sequencing errors	76
PSMC	Diploid genotypes from one individual	Demographic history	Best used in MSMC's PSMC mode, which uses the SMC to more accurately model recombination than the original PSMC; applicable to a single population	78
MSMC	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires large amounts of RAM; cross-coalescence rate should not be interpreted as migration rate	82
CoalHMM	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Multiple applications, including inference of population sizes, migration rates and incomplete lineage sorting	83–87
diCal	Medium-length, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Uses shorter sequences than MSMC, but can be applied to multiple individuals in complex demographic models; infers explicit population genetic parameters for migration rates	89,92
LAMARC	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires Monte Carlo sampling of coalescent genealogies; very flexible	93
BEAST	Short, phased haplotypes	Species trees, effective population sizes	Used mainly as a method of phylogenetic inference. Can also infer population size history	94
MCMCcoal	Short, phased haplotypes	Divergence times between populations	Now incorporated into the software BPP ¹³¹	95
G-PhoCS	Short, (un)phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Incorporates migration into the MCMCcoal framework. Averages over unphased haplotypes	96
Exact likelihoods using generating	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Implemented in Mathematica; applicable only to specific classes of multi-population models	97,98

 Understand population history Bottlenecks, gene flow, etc.



Conservation Present versus historical genetic diversity





Selection
 Demographic history sets neutral background



Yi et al. (2010) Science

Workflow



Beware: Almost all inference tools assume data is clean!





Ne: Effective population size

- The size of an idealized population (in individuals) that would give the same behavior in some regard as the real population of interest.
- Most commonly, variance effective population size, the population size in a Wright-Fisher model that has variance in allele frequencies over time equal to that of the real population.
- Almost always, Ne is less than the census size.
- Ne is affected by breeding ratio, historical demography, etc.
- Other definitions of Ne are possible.
- Arguably, in some populations (Drosophila), variation may be more strongly influenced by selection than drift.



- Developed in the early 1980s, principally by Kingman.
- Approach is to model the genealogy of sampled sequences.
- Rate of coalescence is proportional to 1/Ne.
- Simulators first sample genealogies consistent with specified demographic history.
- To generate sampled sequences, mutations are then added to the genealogy via a Poisson process.
- Can model recombination with the Ancestral Recombination Graph. But selection is extremely challenging.

Simulation via diffusion

- Developed by Fisher and others in the 1930s. Further developed by Kimura in the 1960s.
- Approach is to model the distribution of allele frequencies in the population(s).
- Approximating allele frequencies as continuous allows partial differential equations to be applied.
- Simulation of selection is straightforward. Linkage is very challenging.



Kimura (1964) J Applied Prob

Comparing model and data

- Likelihood: Probability of the data given the model (with specified parameter values).
- Frequentist approach: Maximize likelihood to find best-fit parameters, estimate confidence intervals, perform hypothesis tests.
- Bayesian approach: Sample posterior distribution of parameters based on likelihood function and prior distribution over parameters.

Composite likelihoods

- Often in population genetics, we can't calculate the likelihood of our data.
- But we can often calculate the likelihood for a single site.
- The composite likelihood function is the product of the likelihoods over all sites, implicitly assuming that sites evolve independently.
- Under neutrality, it can be shown that the composite likelihood approximation does not bias inferred parameters (Wiuf (2006) *J Theor Biol*).
- But composite likelihood does mean that many standard statistical inference approaches will be too liberal, because they effectively overestimate the amount of data.

Approximate Bayesian Computation

- Seminal work by Tavare et al. (1997) Genetics
- Simulate data by sampling from the prior distribution
- Calculate summary statistics from the simulation, and compare with summary statistics from the data.
- Accept the sampled parameter set if "distance" between summary statistics is less than some small threshold.
- The set of sampled parameters is an approximation to posterior distribution.
- Very computationally intensive, but very flexible, approach to model fitting, because you can chose summary statistics that are most sensitive to your particular problem.

Demographic Inference Methods

- Many approaches
- My overview will be somewhat selective and historical
- See Schraiber and Akey (2015) Nat Rev Genet for a recent review.

Name	Data type	Inference	Notes	Refs	
STRUCTURE	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	User-friendly GUI; can be computationally demanding		
FRAPPE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Alexander et al. ⁴¹ argue that convergence is not guaranteed		
ADMIXTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Estimates the number of populations via cross-validation error	41	
fastSTRUCTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Obtains variational Bayesian estimates of posterior probability distribution	42	
Structurama	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	Uses a Dirichlet process to estimate the number of populations	43	
HAPMIX	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Requires populations to be specified a priori	48	
fineSTRUCTURE	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Can be used to identify the number and identity of populations	49	
GLOBETROTTER	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Extends the fineSTRUCTURE approach to estimate unsampled ancestral populations and admixture times	7	
LAMP	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Identifies local ancestry in windows, rather than using an HMM, so is more discrete than other approaches	52	
PCAdmix	Phased haplotypes	Chromosome painting, population structure	Uses PCA in small chunks followed by an HMM to estimate local ancestry	53	
dadi	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Requires some Python-coding skills; applicable to up to three populations	60	
Fastsimcoal2	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Can also be used to simulate data under the SMC	62,63	
Treemix	Frequencies of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Admixture graph	Highly multimodal likelihood surface and heuristic search; redo inference from many starting points	64	
fastNeutrino	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Applicable only to a single population; designed specifically for extremely large sample sizes	65	
DoRIS	Lengths of IBD blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic history	IBD must be inferred (for example, using Beagle or GERMLINE); specification of lower cut-off minimizes false-negative IBD tracts	71,72	
IBS tract inference	Lengths of IBS blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic	IBS can easily be confounded by missing data and/or sequencing errors	76	
PSMC	Diploid genotypes from one individual	Demographic history	Best used in MSMC's PSMC mode, which uses the SMC to more accurately model recombination than the original PSMC; applicable to a single population	78	
MSMC	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires large amounts of RAM; cross-coalescence rate should not be interpreted as migration rate	82	
CoalHMM	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Multiple applications, including inference of population sizes, migration rates and incomplete lineage sorting		
diCal	Medium-length, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Uses shorter sequences than MSMC, but can be applied to multiple individuals in complex demographic models; infers explicit population genetic parameters for migration rates		
LAMARC	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires Monte Carlo sampling of coalescent genealogies; very flexible		
BEAST	Short, phased haplotypes	Species trees, effective population sizes	Used mainly as a method of phylogenetic inference. Can also infer population size history	94	
MCMCcoal	Short, phased haplotypes	Divergence times between populations	Now incorporated into the software BPP ¹³¹	95	
G-PhoCS	Short, (un)phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Incorporates migration into the MCMCcoal framework. Averages over unphased haplotypes		
Exact likelihoods using generating functions	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Implemented in Mathematica; applicable only to specific classes of multi-population models		

IM/IMa/IMa2

- Uses coalescent simulation to calculate the full likelihood of the data given the model, for non-recombining regions (mitochondria, Y chromosome,^{ti} small autosomal regions).
- Bayesian inference based on MCMC walk through parameter space, can be computationally expensive.
- Handles arbitrary number of populations.



Allele Frequency Spectrum

- In a population of constant size (the Standard Neutral Model), expectation number of SNPs at frequency i is proportional to 1/i.
- Population growth creates an excess of low-frequency alleles.
- Commonly quantified by Tajima's D.
- Selection generates a similar signal.



Schraiber and Akey (2015) Nat Rev Genet

Schaffner et al. (2005) Genome Research

- Fit model to Africa, Asian, and European human data by using coalescent simulations to match several summary statistics (single-population frequency spectra, F_{ST}, and LD decay).
- Today, this would be called ABC.
- Still no packaged methods that integrate both allele frequencies and LD.



Inference from the AFS

- Marth et al. (2004) Genetics calculated expected frequency spectrum under piecewise constant histories using (big) summation formulas.
- Implemented projection of data down to smaller sample size (for handling incomplete calling) and ^d correction for ascertainment bias (for handling genotype data).
- Fit growth and bottleneck models to human populations from Africa, Europe, and Asia.



Parameter identifiability



- Often the likelihood surface has "ridges", correlated sets of parameters that give very similar high likelihoods.
- For example, depth and duration of bottleneck.

Absolute limits to inference

- Myers, Fefferman, and Patterson (2008) Theor Pop Biol
- Can show analytically that even an infinite amount of frequency spectrum data does not uniquely determine population history.
- Recent results from Song show that can uniquely determine piecewise constant histories.



A demographic history with the same spectrum as a constant size population

Joint Allele Frequency Spectrum

Single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs)



TGGTCACTCTTATCATTATGT TGGTCACTCTTATCATTATGT



TGGTCACTCTTAACATTCTGT

TG<mark>C</mark>TCATTCTTATCATTATGT



TGCTCATTCTTATCATTCTGT TGCTCACTCTTAACATTATGT



AG<mark>CTCAC</mark>TCGTA<mark>T</mark>CATT<mark>C</mark>TGT

Derived allele freq. in 2









dadi: Diffusion Approximations
 for Demographic Inference

- Up to three interacting populations, with arbitrary parameter time courses
- I pop, 20 samples, ~3 params: ~1 minute to fit
 2 pops, 20 samples each, ~6 params: ~10 minutes to fit
 3 pops, 20 samples each, ~12 params: ~3 hours to fit
- Computational cost independent of SNP count, but exponential in number of populations.

Gutenkunst et al. PLoS Genet (2009)

fastsimcoal2

- Estimate pairwise joint frequency spectra using coalescent simulations.
- Scales to arbitrary number of populations.
- Estimate parameters by maximum composite likelihood.
- Optimization may be more robust than ∂a∂i.



Excoffier et al. PLoS Genet (2013)

Jaatha

- Partition joint AFS into 23 distinct regions and use simulations to fit to these summary statistics.
- Recently applied to simultaneously infer demography and selection. (Mathew and Jensen (2015) *Frontiers Genet*).



Naduvilezhath et al. (2011) *Molec Ecol*

MOMI

- Kamm, Terhorst, and Song (2015) arXiv
- Use coalescent theory to calculate expected joint frequency spectra for arbitrary number of populations and demography that piecewise constant or exponential.
- Should be faster and more numerically stable than diffusion or coalescent simulation methods.
- Software forthcoming.

Sequentially Markovian Coalescent

- Introduced by McVean and Cardin (2005) Phil Trans R Soc B as approximation to standard coalescent with recombination.
- Essential assumption is that when recombination occurs the genealogy to the right of the recombination event depends only on the genealogy to the left of the event. (Hence the name Sequentially Markovian Coalescent.)
- Often an excellent approximation to the full coalescent, while being much faster to computer, and more amenable to analysis.

Haplotype lengths

- The genomes of admixed individuals will be mosaics of the source populations.
- As time passes since admixture, recombination breaks up admixture tracts.
- TRACTS infers admixture times (potentially multiple pulses) and proportions from the spectrum of haplotype lengths.



Gravel et al. Genetics (2012)

IBS tracts

- Sequences that are Identical By State (IBS) with and between populations are informative about demographic history.
- Calculate expected spectrum of IBS tract lengths using coalescent theory.
- Can fit very complex models.



Harris and Nielsen (2013) PLoS Genet

<u>Same model, same data,</u> different summary, different results







- Estimate effective population size over time from a single unphased genome.
- No parametric model (e.g. exponential growth) assumed.

Li and Durbin (2011) *Nature*

MSMC



- SMC model for multiple phased sequences
- Inferences of population sizes for more recent times than PSMC.
- Inferences of cross-coalescent rates between populations, which are indicative of population divergence and migration.

Schiffels and Durbin Nature Genet (2014)

Demographic Inference Methods

- Many options...
- For inference from non-recombining regions, IMa2 is most powerful.
- For inference from many short sequences (RAD-seq, transcriptomes), frequency spectrum methods are most powerful.
- If you can reliably phase and align your data, haplotype methods are very powerful.

Demography and selection in orang-utans

Orang-utans



Sequencing



Locke et al. *Natur*e (2011)

Reference genome sequencing 5.6-fold Sanger coverage of Sumatran female ~2.5% divergence from human

Population genomic sequencing

5 Sumatran and 5 Bornean individuals on Illumina GAII one Bornean individual to 20-fold, rest to ~8-fold ~0.3% divergence between Bornean and Sumatran

Custom Bayesian SNP caller overall 99% concordance with Sanger validation ~8% false positive rate for singletons

Demographic inference



Selection against non-synonymous mutations



PLoS ONE (2013)

History and selection in African pygmies

Ping-Hsun Hsieh



Collaborators Michael Hammer Sarah Tishkoff Krishna Veeramah

Hsieh et al. (In press) Genome Research Data and demographic history



Whole Genome Data

Biaka pygmy: 4 individuals from Hammer lab Baka pygmy: 3 individuals from Tishkoff lab Yoruba farmer: 9 individuals





Scanning for adaptive loci

Hsieh et al.

(In press) Genome Research



Hsieh et al. (In press) Genome Research

Adaptive loci

- P value cutoff top 0.5%
- G2D value cutoff top 0.5%



- Bone synthesis: FLNB, AXDNDI, EPHBI, TSPAN5, ZBTB38, GAREM
- Muscle development: OBSCN, COX10, LARGE
- Immunity: 3 HLA genes

Demographic Inference

Ryan Gutenkunst Molecular and Cellular Biology University of Arizona

Data tuna

1.6.....

	ame	Data type	merence	Notes
S	STRUCTURE	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	User-friendly GUI; can be computationally demanding
FF	FRAPPE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Alexander et al. ⁴¹ argue that convergence is not guaranteed
A	ADMIXTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Estimates the number of populations via cross-validation error
fa	fastSTRUCTURE	Unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Population structure, admixture	Obtains variational Bayesian estimates of posterior probability distribution
St	Structurama	Unlinked multi-allelic genotypes	Population structure, admixture	Uses a Dirichlet process to estimate the number of populations
н	HAPMIX	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Requires populations to be specified a priori
fir	fineSTRUCTURE	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Can be used to identify the number and identity of populations
G	GLOBETROTTER	Phased haplotypes	Population structure, admixture, chromosome painting	Extends the fineSTRUCTURE approach to estimate unsampled ancestral populations and admixture times
L	LAMP	Phased haplotypes; reference panel	Chromosome painting	Identifies local ancestry in windows, rather than using an HMM, so is more discrete than other approaches
P	PCAdmix	Phased haplotypes	Chromosome painting, population structure	Uses PCA in small chunks followed by an HMM to estimate local ancestry $% \left({{{\rm{D}}_{\rm{A}}}} \right)$
de	dadi	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Requires some Python-coding skills; applicable to up to three populations
Fa	Fastsimcoal2	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Can also be used to simulate data under the SMC
Tr	Treemix	Frequencies of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Admixture graph	Highly multimodal likelihood surface and heuristic search; redo inference from many starting points
fa	fastNeutrino	Frequency spectrum of unlinked bi-allelic SNVs	Demographic history	Applicable only to a single population; designed specifically for extremely large sample sizes
D	DoRIS	Lengths of IBD blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic history	IBD must be inferred (for example, using Beagle or GERMLINE); specification of lower cut-off minimizes false-negative IBD tracts
IB	IBS tract inference	Lengths of IBS blocks between pairs of individuals	Demographic	IBS can easily be confounded by missing data and/or sequencing errors
P	PSMC	Diploid genotypes from one individual	Demographic history	Best used in MSMC's PSMC mode, which uses the SMC to more accurately model recombination than the original PSMC; applicable to a single population
М	MSMC	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires large amounts of RAM; cross-coalescence rate should not be interpreted as migration rate
C	CoalHMM	Whole genome, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Multiple applications, including inference of population sizes, migration rates and incomplete lineage sorting
di	diCal	Medium-length, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Uses shorter sequences than MSMC, but can be applied to multiple individuals in complex demographic models; infers explicit population genetic parameters for migration rates
	LAMARC	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Requires Monte Carlo sampling of coalescent genealogies; very flexible
В	BEAST	Short, phased haplotypes	Species trees, effective population sizes	Used mainly as a method of phylogenetic inference. Can also infer population size history
М	MCMCcoal	Short, phased haplotypes	Divergence times between populations	Now incorporated into the software BPP ¹³¹
G	G-PhoCS	Short, (un)phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Incorporates migration into the MCMCcoal framework. Averages over unphased haplotypes
E) u fu	Exact likelihoods using generating functions	Short, phased haplotypes	Demographic history	Implemented in Mathematica; applicable only to specific classes of multi-population models